| **Student Name:** Isabella Zhu |
| --- |

| **Motion:** This house will ban all political lobbying |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | **N/A** | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 72 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| **Teacher comments:**  [NOTE: Today’s speeches are 5 minutes’ long.]  Nice hook, clear and high-impact! If we illustrated the human costs, that would be even more impactful.  On the set-up:   * Good clarity on what lobbying is and what the ban would look like.   + Aside from fines, we can eliminate political candidates altogether if they took lobby money. That will be more effective. * Excellent job explaining how funding will be raised in your new world, so that politicians can continue campaigning without corporate money.   + However, it isn’t clear HOW the state is going to encourage this, do these movements even have the same level of resources? * I appreciate the framing that regulations won’t work as well as a ban, but it’s not clear how this is the case. * We could use some illustrations on who are the dominant lobby groups to characterise the status quo as one that is controlled by evil lobbyists, rather than good lobbyists. * We still need a winning pathway/burden.   While the POI response explains why politicians take lobbying money, we need to weigh this benefit against the public backlash for taking money from evil actors!   * We need to explain why voters can never compete with lobbyists when it comes to influencing policy decisions: * There is power asymmetry. Civilians cannot donate as much as companies. * It is political suicide to abandon your sponsors. * Voters can be convinced using a multitude of other political strategies.   Well done on the characterisation of the harms that these companies perpetuate!   * I see the harmful public policies entirely and uniquely created by powerful lobbyists, but we are not highlighting the human costs, e.g. mass shootings in the US due to the NRA gun lobby.   + Also, explain why even though lobbyists can be both good and bad, it is dominated by mainly bad and wealthy groups, and these politicians can never be held accountable for prioritising lobbyists over voters. * We need to explain how or why politicians cannot be held accountable for being responsible for the harms they are actively causing! Why can’t we simply punish politicians for being evil.   Where are any of the impacts to democracy?   * Explain how lobbying undercuts the democratic representation of voters, and then explain why representation is important. * Weigh why the loss of democratic participation of lobby groups is insignificant, as they can still participate as individuals.   Be comparative with Opp’s biggest concern, that political campaigns would have completely ineffective outreach with the billions removed from the political market.  Good job offering POIs today!  5.30 | | | | | | |